

# Towards A Critical Assessment Of A Scholarly Article

CS6606\*

Take 3 – 5 minutes to do each of the following

- ① Determine the purpose(s) of the article
  - some may be explicitly stated and others only implied
  - if there is no clear purpose then something is wrong with the article
- ② Make a list of all of the factors you think may be relevant to the purpose(s)
  - do not limit yourself to the reasoning presented in the article itself
  - also consider the purposes of the article from someone else's point of view
- ③ Make a list of factors that you find in the article that are presented as relevant
  - compare the list of factors you made with the list you extracted from the article
  - did the author(s) leave anything out?
  - did you not think of something that the author(s) did?
  - what are the most important factors?
- ④ Consider the ideas raised by the article and summarized in the conclusion
  - for each idea describe it as one of
    - plus** a positive consequence
    - minus** a negative consequence
    - interesting** worth further investigation
- ⑤ What next?
  - consider the consequences of the conclusions of the article
  - what should the next step be?
  - how would you like to see the article extended (with more work) or expanded (with more detail about existing work)?

---

\*Based on a presentation by Sunny Marche which was based on CoRT by Edward de Bono